

SCIENCE AND MEDICINE IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE
 SINCE THE ENLIGHTENMENT
 PAUL J SHIN
 EXAMINER: JOHN HARLEY WARNER

“Reason resides in both the liberation that it promises, and the forms of domination that it provokes”

-Immanuel Kant. Was ist Äufklarung?

- I. EPISTEMOLOGY AT THE INTERSTICES: SCIENCE AND MEDICINE
- II. SCIENCE AND THE “PROFESSIONALIZATION” OF MEDICINE
- III. A DOUBLE-EDGED SWORD: THE CULTURAL MEANINGS OF SCIENCE IN MEDICINE.

*CROSS-LISTED WITH OTHER FIELDS

EPISTEMOLOGY AT THE INTERSTICES: SCIENCE AND MEDICINE

Overviews

- Bynum, William F. *Science and the Practice of Medicine in the Nineteenth Century*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Daston, Lorraine and Peter Galison. *Objectivity*. New York: Zone Books, 2007.
- Foucault, Michel. *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archeology of Medical Perception*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1973.
- Pickstone, John V. *Ways of Knowing: A New History of Science, Technology and Medicine*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001.

System/Taxonomy

- Cunningham, Andrew. “Medicine to Calm the Mind: Boerhaave’s Medical System, and Why it was Adopted in Edinburgh,” in *The Medical Enlightenment of the Eighteenth Century*, Andrew Cunningham and Roger French, eds. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- *Gaudio, Michael. “Swallowing the Evidence: William Bartram and the Limits of Enlightenment,” *Winterthur Portfolio*, (Spring 2001).
- *Looby, Christopher. “The Constitution of Nature: Taxonomy as Politics in Jefferson, Peale, and Bartram,” *Early American Literature*, 22 (1987), 252-273.
- Porter, Roy. “Enlightenment,” in *The Greatest Benefit To Mankind: A Medical History From Antiquity to the Present*, Roy Porter, ed. London: Harper Collins, 1997.

Surgery

- Brieger, Gert. “From Conservative to Radical Surgery in Late-Nineteenth Century America,” in *Medical Theories, Surgical Practice: Studies in the History of Surgery*, Christopher Lawrence, ed. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- Gelfand, Toby. *Professionalizing Modern Medicine: Paris Surgeons and Medical Science and Institutions in the 18th Century*. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1980.

- Lawrence, Christopher. "The History and Historiography of Surgery" in *Medical theories, Surgical Practice: Studies in the History of Surgery*, Christopher Lawrence, ed. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- Nicholson, Malcolm. "Giovanni Batista Morgagni and the 18th Century Physical Exam," in *Medical theory Surgical Practice: Studies in the History of Surgery*," Christopher Lawrence, ed. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- Temkin, Owsei. "The Role of Surgery in the Rise of Modern Medical Thought," *Bull. Hist. Med.*, 25(1951): 248-59.

Observation/Empiricism

- Ackerknecht, Erwin. *Medicine at the Paris Hospital, 1794-1848*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1967.
- Cook, Harold. "Physicians and Natural History," in *Cultures of Natural History*, ed. Nicholas Jardine, James Secord, and Emma Spary. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Maulitz, Russell C. *Morbid Appearances: The Anatomy of Pathology in the Early Nineteenth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Warner, John Harley. *Against the Spirit of System: The French Impulse in Nineteenth-Century American Medicine*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998.

Interventional/Laboratory

- Canguilhem, Georges. *On the Normal and the Pathological*. Dordrecht: Reidel Publishing Co., 1978.
- Fye, Bruce W. "Physiology," in *Physiology in the American Context, 1850-1940*, Gerald L. Geison, ed. Bethesda: American Physiological Society, 1987.
- Lesch, John E. *Science and medicine in France: the Emergence of Experimental Physiology, 1790-1855*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1984.
- Marks, Harry. *The Progress of Experiment: Science and Therapeutic Reform in the United States, 1900-1990*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Worboys, Michael. *Spreading Germs: Disease Theories and Medical Practice in Britain 1865-1900*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.

SCIENCE AND THE "PROFESSIONALIZATION" OF MEDICINE

Edinburgh

- Jacyna, L. Stephen. *Philosophic Whigs: Medicine, Science, and Citizenship in Edinburgh, 1789-1848*. New York: Routledge Press, 1994.
- Risse, Guenther B. *Hospital Life in Enlightenment Scotland: Care and Teaching at the Royal Infirmary*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986.
- Rosner, Lisa. *Medical Education in the Age of Improvement: Edinburgh Students and Apprentices, 1760-1820*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1991.

France:

Ramsey, Matthew. *Professional and Popular Medicine in France, 1770-1830: the Social World of Medical Practice*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1988.

_____. "The Politics of Professional Monopoly in Nineteenth-Century Medicine: The French Model and Its Rivals," in *Professions and the French State, 1700-1900*, Gerald Geison, ed. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1984.

England

Cooter, Roger and Steve Sturdy. "Science, Scientific Management, and the Transformation of Medicine in Britain c.1870-1950," *History of Science* 36 (1998), 421- 466.

Digby, Anne. *The Evolution of British General Practice, 1850-1948*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Lawrence, Susan. *Charitable Knowledge: Hospital Pupils and Practitioners in Eighteenth-Century London*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

Loudon, Irvine. *Medical Care and the General Practitioner, 1750-1850*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986.

Peterson, M. Jeanne. *The Medical Profession in Mid-Victorian London*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978.

United States

Kept, Joseph F. *The Formation of the American Medical Profession: the Role of Institutions, 1780-1860*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1968.

Ludmerer, Kenneth. *Learning to Heal: the Development of American Medical Education*. New York: Basic Books, 1985.

Pernick, Martin. *A Calculus of Suffering: Pain, Professionalism, and Anesthesia in Nineteenth-Century America*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1985.

Rothstein, William F. *American Physicians in the Nineteenth Century: From Sects to Science*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1992.

Starr, Paul. *The Social Transformation of American Medicine*. New York: Basic Books 1984.

Germany

Broman, Thomas. *The Transformation of German Academic Medicine, 1750-1820*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

III. A Double-Edged Sword: The Cultural Meanings of Science in Medicine

Warner, John Harley. "The History of Science and the Science of Medicine," *Osiris* (1995): 164-191.

Bodies

* *Useful Bodies: Humans in the Service of Medical Science in the Twentieth Century*, Jordon Goodman, Anthony McElligott, and Lara Marks, eds. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003.

- * Jordanova Ludmilla. *Sexual Visions: Images of Gender in Science and Medicine Between the 18th and 20th Centuries*. New York: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1989.
- *Nemerov, Alexander. "Great Unknowns: The Anatomical Sculptures of William Rush and the Problem of Democratic Scale," in *Mammoth Scale: The Anatomical Sculptures of William Rush*. Philadelphia: Wistar Institute, 2002.
- Richardson, Ruth. *Death, Dissection, and the Destitute*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000.
- Sappol, Michael. *A Traffic of Dead Bodies: Anatomy and Embodied Social Identity in Nineteenth-Century America*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002.

Women/Gender

- ***Berger, Martin.** *Man Made: Thomas Eakins and the Construction of Gilded Age Manhood*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000.
- *Goodbody, Bridget L. "'The Present Opprobrium of Surgery': 'The Agnew Clinic' and Nineteenth-Century Cancerous Female Breast," *American Art*, 8:1(1994), 32-51.
- *Lerner, Barron H. *The Breast Cancer Wars: Hope, Fear, and the Pursuit of a Cure in Twentieth-Century America*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001
- Morantz-Sanchez, Regina. *Sympathy and Science: Women Physicians in American Medicine*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1985.
- _____. *Conduct Unbecoming a Woman: Medicine on Trial in Turn-of-the-Century Brooklyn*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- More, Ellen S. *Restoring the Balance: Women Physicians and the Profession of Medicine, 1850-1995*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Silver-Isenstadt, Jean. *Shameless: The Visionary Life of Mary Grove Nichols*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2002.
- *Werbel, Amy. *Thomas Eakins: Art, Medicine, and Sexuality in Nineteenth-Century Philadelphia*. New Haven: Yale University, 2007.
- Ulrich, Laurel Thatcher. *A Midwife's Tale: The Life of Martha Ballard, 1785-1812*. New York: Vintage Books, 1990.

Medical Practice: Clinical Art, Clinical Science?

- Crenner, Christopher. *Private Practice in the Early Twentieth Century Medical Office of Dr. Richard Cabot*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005.
- Geison, Gerald. "Divided We Stand: Physiologists and Clinicians in the American Context," in *The Therapeutic Revolution: Essays in the Social History of American Medicine*, Morris J. Vogel and Charles Rosenberg, eds. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1979.
- Lawrence, Christopher. "Incommunicable Knowledge: Science, Technology, and the Clinical Art in Britain 1850-1914," *Journal of Contemporary History*, 20(1985), 203-220.
- _____. "Still Incommunicable: Clinical Holists and Medical Knowledge in Interwar Britain," in *Greater than the Parts: Holism in Biomedicine, 1920-1950*, Christopher Lawrence and George Weisz, eds. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

_____. *Rockefeller Money, The Laboratory and Medicine in Edinburgh, 1919-1930: New Science in an Old Country*. Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2005.

Warner, John Harley. *The Therapeutic Perspective: Medical Practice, Knowledge, and Identity in America 1820-1885*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997.

Stowe, Steven. *Doctoring the South: Southern Physicians and Everyday Medicine in the Mid-Nineteenth Century*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2004.

Medical Knowledge: Cultural, Universal? Case Study: Fin de Siècle America

* Anderson, Warwick. *Colonial Pathologies: American Tropical Medicine, Race and Hygiene*. Durham: University of North Carolina Press, 2006.

* **Aronowitz, Robert. *Unnatural History: Breast Cancer and American Society*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007.**

* Fairchild, Amy. *Science at the Borders: Immigrant Medical Inspection and the Shaping of the Modern Industrial Workforce*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003.

*Feldberg, Georgina. *Disease and Class: Tuberculosis and the Shaping of Modern North American Society*. Camden: Rutgers University Press, 1995.

*Kline, Wendy. *Building a Better Race: Gender, Sexuality, and Eugenics from the Turn of the Century to the Baby Boom*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.

* Leavitt, Judith. *Typhoid Mary: Captive to the Public's Health*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1996.

_____. "‘Typhoid Mary’ Strikes Back: Bacteriological Theory and Practice in Twentieth-Century Public Health," *Isis* 83 (1992), 608-629.

* Markel, Howard. *Quarantine! East European Jewish Immigrants and the New York City Epidemics of 1892*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997.

*Pyne, Kathleen. *Art and the Higher Life: Painting and Evolutionary Thought in Late Nineteenth-Century America*. Austin: University of Austin Press, 1996.

* Shah, Nayan. *Contagious Divides: Epidemics and Race in San Francisco's Chinatown*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.

* Tomes, Nancy. *The Gospel of Germs: Men, Women, and the Microbe in American Life*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1998.

View Medical Epistemology Research Papers on Academia.edu for free. In this paper I analyse the dissent around evidence standards in medicine and pharmacology as a result of distinct ways to address epistemic losses in our game with nature and the scientific ecosystem: an "elitist" and a "pluralist" more. In this paper I analyse the dissent around evidence standards in medicine and pharmacology as a result of distinct ways to address epistemic losses in our game with nature and the scientific ecosystem: an "elitist" and a "pluralist" approach. Clear examples and definition of Epistemology. Epistemology is the study of knowledge. It raises questions like "What is truth?" But these were the best ideas available at the time, and they worked well in helping Greek culture thrive. So were these ideas right at the time, but now they're wrong? That seems like an odd thing to say, but it is implied by pragmatism. III. Epistemology asks questions like: "What is knowledge?", "How is knowledge acquired?", "What do people know?", "What are the necessary and sufficient conditions of knowledge?", "What is its structure, and what are its limits?", "What makes justified beliefs justified?", "How we are to understand the concept of justification?", "Is justification internal or external to one's own mind?" The kind of knowledge usually discussed in Epistemology is propositional knowledge, "knowledge-that" as opposed to "knowledge-how" (for example, the knowledge that $2 + 2 = 4$), as opposed to the knowledge of how to... On my way to my noon class, exactly twelve hours later, I glance at the clock and form the belief that the time is 11:56.